Population Dynamics of the Citrus Leafminer, Phyllocnistis citrella (Lepidoptera: Gracillariidae), and Its Natural Enemies in Texas and Mexico

Jesusa Crisostomo Legaspi, J. Victor French,1 Aurora Garza Zuñiga,2 and Benjamin C. Legaspi, Jr.
Texas Agricultural Experiment Station, The Texas A&M University System, 2415 East Highway 83, Weslaco, Texas 78596

Received August 1, 2000; accepted December 22, 2000

The citrus leafminer, Phyllocnistis citrella Stainton (Lepidoptera: Gracillariidae), was unreported in the western hemisphere until May 1993 when it was discovered in citrus nurseries in Florida. In Mexico, P. citrella was reported in 1994 in the state of Tamaulipas. Because of the potential threat to the citrus industries in both countries, a binational collaborative research project was initiated in 1997 to define and compare the status of P. citrella and levels of biological control between the two countries. In general, P. citrella populations increased in Mexico over the 3-year period from 1997 to 1999. In 1997, P. citrella peaked at ∼0.4 immatures/leaf in mid-October. In 1999, the pest began to increase in April, reaching peaks of ∼1.0 larva/leaf in early July. In both years, overall parasitism averaged ∼20%. The dominant parasitoid in Mexico was Zagrammosoma multilineatum (Ashmead) (Hymenoptera: Eulophidae), which constituted > 30% of the parasitoid complex. Predators recovered were Chrysopeia spp. (Neuroptera: Chrysopidae), Orius insidiosus (Say) (Hemiptera: Anthocoridae), and Hippodamia convergens Guerin-Meneville (Coleoptera: Coccinellidae). In contrast, P. citrella generally declined in Texas over the same period. In 1997, the pest peaked at 0.8 immatures/leaf in August and did not exceed 0.4 immatures/leaf in 1998. The decline of P. citrella in south Texas is more evident when compared to a 1995 survey when pest densities exceeded 6.0 immatures/leaf. The monthly percentage parasitism of P. citrella in Texas increased from < 1% in May to ∼10% in November 1997. In contrast, parasitism in 1998 fluctuated from 0 to 20%. Numbers of parasites were always < 0.05 individuals/leaf and often zero. Similar to Mexico, the dominant parasitoid was Z. multilineatum, which constituted 46.2% (128 of 277) of the parasitoids sampled. Differences in P. citrella populations and those of its parasitoid complexes may be partially attributed to a hotter, drier climate in Texas than in Mexico.

INTRODUCTION

The citrus leafminer, Phyllocnistis citrella Stainton (Lepidoptera: Gracillariidae), originated from southeast Asia and established itself as a major pest of citrus throughout Australia, the Middle East, and parts of Africa (Heppner and Dixon, 1995). Phyllocnistis citrella was unreported in the western hemisphere until May 1993 when the leafminer was discovered in citrus nurseries in Dade County, Florida (Heppner, 1995). Within 3 months, P. citrella had spread rapidly throughout the commercial citrus-growing areas of Florida, attaining the status of a major pest. The leafminer subsequently spread to other areas in Central, South, and North America, as well as the Caribbean (Peña et al., 1996). The known geographical range of P. citrella in the continental United States currently includes Alabama, Louisiana, and Texas (Legaspi et al., 1999), and most recently, California (L. Beazk, California Department of Food and Agriculture, pers. comm.). In Mexico, P. citrella was reported in 1994 in the state of Tamaulipas, with subsequent reports in Veracruz, Hidalgo, Nuevo Leon, and Colima (Perales-Gutierrez et al., 1996; Bautista-Martinez et al., 1998). The discovery of P. citrella in Mexico was viewed as a potential threat to the Mexican citrus industry, which ranks sixth internationally with a total annual production of > 3,845,000 tons.

The leafminer attacks all cultivars of citrus, related species within the Rutaceae family, and several ornamentals (Legaspi and French, 1996). Plant damage is caused by the leafminer larvae as they bore through the leaf epidermis. Leaves become chlorotic, often deformed, and susceptible to infection by fungi or bacteria. Control measures include insecticides such as chlorfenapyr and tebufenozide (French et al., 1997) and...
cultural controls to limit growth of the susceptible young flushes (Legaspi and French, 1996).

Biological control is a promising pest management option against P. citrella. Recent records indicate that ≈80 species of parasitoids have been reared from the leafminer worldwide (Schauff et al., 1998). Over 20 New World parasitoids were recorded on P. citrella as its geographical range increased, thereby resulting in fortuitous or “new association” biological control. These parasitoids are predominantly in the family Eulophidae, although others belong to the Elaspididae, Eupelmidae, and Pteromalidae (LaSalle and Peña, 1997). Efforts at classical biological control of P. citrella have focused on the introduction of Ageniaspis citricola Logvinovskaya (Hymenoptera: Encyrtidae) in Florida and Texas. Between May 1994 and September 1995, A. citricola (originally from Thailand) was imported from Australia and released into 52 sites in southwest Florida (Pomerinke and Stansly, 1998). Ageniaspis citricola has apparently established, attaining parasitism levels of 86% in October 1995 and surviving winter frosts. A similar program was undertaken in south Texas, but A. citricola has not established to date (Legaspi et al., 1999). The eulophid Cirrospilus ingenuus Gahan [= C. quadristriatus (Subba Rao & Ramamani)] is another parasitoid from southeast Asia that has been released against P. citrella in many countries, including Australia, Cyprus, Israel, Morocco, Oman, Syria, Tunisia, and Turkey (Schauff et al., 1998). Cirrospilus ingenuus was released in limited numbers in Florida in 1994 and recovered in field collections taken in November 1997 and January 1998, although the impact on the leafminer is unknown (LaSalle et al., 1999).

The proximity of the citrus-producing areas along the border of Texas and Mexico suggests possible commonalities in pest species, as well as their solutions. A binational collaborative research project was initiated to define and compare the status of P. citrella and levels of biological control between the two countries. In this paper, we report the results of this project, i.e., the population dynamics of P. citrella and its natural enemies from 1997 to 1999 in south Texas and Nuevo Leon, Mexico.

MATERIALS AND METHODS


Sampling for P. citrella and its natural enemies was conducted in the Mexican state of Nuevo Leon (located between 23° 10' to 27° 47' 30" N and 98° 24' 38" to 101° 12' 09' W; about 425 m above sea level) from February to December in 1997 and 1999. Five orchards were selected: three in Montemorelos and two in General Teran. The orchards in Montemorelos were planted to "Valencia" orange [Citrus sinensis (L.) Osbeck var "Valencia"], 'Ruby Red' grapefruit (Citrus paradisi Macf.), and 'Dancy' tangerine (Citrus reticulata Blanco). Orchards in General Teran were planted only to 'Valencia' oranges.


Sampling in Texas was conducted in the citrus-growing areas of the Lower Rio Grande Valley (situated between 25° 50' to 26° 18' N and 97° 20' to 98° 15' W; ≈11 m above sea level). In 1997, leaves were collected from May to November; in 1998, collections were performed from April to December. The orchards were planted to grapefruit, orange, and lemon [C. limon (L.) Burm.]. Unlike the collections in Mexico, leaf samples were not taken from predetermined sites; orchards were selected randomly to represent the geographical boundaries of the citrus-growing area of south Texas. Comparisons were made of historical temperature and rainfall data between citrus-growing areas of Texas (represented by Harlingen) and Mexico (represented by Montemorelos) to assess possible effects of climate on differences in population dynamics between the two countries.

Sampling Procedure

At about 2-week intervals, leaf samples were collected from selected citrus orchards in Texas and Mexico. About 100 expanded tender leaves were collected from each site, placed in plastic bags, and taken to the laboratory for examination. Numbers of leaves sampled and total numbers of P. citrella (sum of live and dead larvae, pupae, pupal cases) were recorded. Parasitized larvae were reared out and eclosing parasitoids were identified. In Mexico, numbers of predators were also recorded. Total numbers of parasitoids were calculated by adding numbers of parasitoids identified, together with those unidentified or that died prior to emergence. Percentage parasitism at a given time was calculated by dividing total numbers of parasitoids with the numbers of emergent parasitoids and leafminers.

Parasitoid identifications were performed by J. Woolley (Department of Entomology, Texas A&M University, College Station) and M. Reyes (Instituto Nacional de Investigaciones Forestales y Agropecuarias, Rio Bravo, Mexico). Voucher specimens of the parasitoid species collected from Texas are deposited at the USDA ARS Systematic Entomology Laboratory (Beltsville, MD).

Statistical Analysis

To test the effect of host density on percentage parasitism, regression analyses were performed on per-
cennial parasitism (dependent variable) and numbers of
P. citrella hosts per leaf (independent variable; sam-
ples with zero hosts were excluded). Data were pooled
d by country. Percentage data were transformed (arc-
sine-square root method), prior to analyses, but are
presented as untransformed data (Sokal and Rohlf,
1981). Mean monthly temperature and rainfall data of
Texas and Mexico were compared using paired t tests
(paired by month). Statistical analyses were performed
using Systat (SPSS, Chicago, IL).

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Population Dynamics of P. citrella and Its Natural
Enemies in Nuevo Leon, Mexico (1997 and 1999)

The total numbers of P. citrella and its natural ene-
emies are shown in numbers per leaf (Fig. 1). Popula-
tions of P. citrella began to increase during the summer
months of 1997, reaching at \( \sim 0.4 \) immatures/leaf in
mid-October (Fig. 1A). In 1999, P. citrella populations
began to increase earlier (in April) and numbers per
leaf were generally higher, reaching peaks of \( \sim 1.0/\text{leaf} \)
in early July and \( \sim 0.5/\text{leaf} \) in late September (Fig. 1B).
In both years, overall parasitism averaged \( \sim 20\% \).
However, parasites were recovered earlier in the year
in 1999 (early May) compared to 1997 (mid-J une) (Figs.
1C and 1D). The parasitoid Z. multilineatum (Ash-
mead) (Eulophidae) increased in dominance from 1997
to 1999 (Figs. 1E and 1F). In 1997, Z. multilineatum
constituted 32\% of parasitoids recorded (62 Z. multilin-
eatatum/194 total parasitoids), increasing slightly to
38\% (297/782) in 1999. Predators recovered on citrus
leaves were larvae of Chrysoperla spp. (Neuroptera:
Chrysopidae), Orius insidious (Say) (Hemiptera: An-
thocoridae), and Hippodamia convergens Guerin-Me-
ville (Coleoptera: Coccinellidae) (Figs. 1G and 1H).
From a total predator sample of 2504 collected, Chry-
soperla constituted 48.7\% (1220), O. insidious, 28.1\%
(703), and H. convergens, 23.2\% (581).

In summary, over the 3-year period from 1997 to
1999, P. citrella populations generally increased in the
sample sites in Nuevo Leon, with Z. multilineatum
being the dominant parasitoid. Although Perales-Gu-
tierrez et al. (1996) reported Z. multilineatum as a
parasitoid of P. citrella in the Mexican state of Colima,
the relative dominance of the species was not reported.
In contrast, Bautista-Martinez et al. (1998) did not
report Z. multilineatum as a parasitoid of P. citrella in
the state of Veracruz.

Population Dynamics of P. citrella and Its Natural

When sampling was initiated in May 1997, numbers
of P. citrella per leaf were already quite high, at about
0.6 total insects/leaf (Fig. 2A). The peak of 0.8/leaf was
reached in August, after which numbers declined in
the fall. Populations of P. citrella were lower in the
following year, never exceeding 0.4/leaf (Fig. 2B).
These surveys indicate a general decline in levels of P.
citrella populations in south Texas, especially when
compared with 1995, when pest densities exceeded 6.0/
leaf during the summer (Legaspi et al., 1999).

The monthly percentage parasitism of P. citrella in
Texas increased from \(<1\%\) in May 1997 to \(\sim 10\%\)
in November (Fig. 2C). In contrast, parasitism in 1998
fluctuated from 0 to 20\% with no definite trend appar-
ent (Fig. 2D). Numbers of parasites were low for both
1997 and 1998, always \( < 0.05/\text{leaf} \) and often zero. A
total of 277 parasitoids were recorded in 1997, of which
128 (46.2\%) were Z. multilineatum. Other parasitoids
reared were Closteroecus sp. (22 individuals; 7.9\% of
parasitoids) and Pnigalo sp. (4; 1.4\%). In 1998, only 41
parasitoids were recorded, of which Z. multilineatum
was most abundant (13; 31.7\%). Also found were Clo-
steroecus sp. (3; 7.3\%) and PNigalo sp. (1; 2.4\%). A
comparison with the surveys conducted in south Texas
in 1995 and 1996 (Legaspi et al., 1999) indicates de-
clines in the native parasitoid complex attacking P.
citrella. The maximum percentage parasitism in 1996
was almost 40\%. The maximum level of 20\% that we
found in 1998 (Fig. 2D) is misleading because of the low
host densities available (Fig. 2B). To compare parosi-
toid patterns from 1995 to 1998, we calculated totals of
numbers of leaves sampled during each year and num-
bers of parasitoids reared from those leaves using data
presented here and in Legaspi et al. (1999). From a
total of 1650 leaves sampled in 1995, 111 total parasi-
toids were reared, yielding an overall count of 6.7 para-
sitoids/100 leaves. Corresponding counts in 1996
through 1998 were 8.6 (314 parasitoids from 3658
leaves), 9.4 (605/6426), and 0.81 parasitoids/100 leaves
(42/5160), respectively. A large decline in parasitoids
was thus recorded only in 1998, whereas P. citrella
showed large declines by 1997. Similar to Legaspi et al.
(1999), we were unable to recover A. citricola that was
released in south Texas in early 1995.

Overall percentage parasitism was higher in Mexico
(17.2\%; \( SE = 1.8; \ n = 25 \) ) than in Texas (9.6\%; \( SE =
1.5; \ n = 39 \) ) (\( t = 2.7; \ df = 23; \ P < 0.05 \) ). The
numbers of P. citrella hosts per leaf and percentage
parasitism yielded a significant regression in Mexico
(Fig. 3A) (\( F = 11.4; \ df = 1, 23; \ P < 0.01; \ R^2 = 0.33 \))
but not in Texas (Fig. 3B) (\( F = 1.03; \ df = 1, 36; \ P =
0.32; \ R^2 < 0.01 \)). While this result is interesting, it
is difficult to draw strong conclusions regarding the ap-
parent density-dependent parasitism found in Mexico
and its absence in Texas. In both countries, Z. multilin-
eatatum was the dominant parasitoid. Furthermore,
parasitoids of P. citrella usually are not host specific
but are generalists that attack other lepidopteran leaf-
miners (Peña et al., 1996). Therefore, strong host-
parasitoid interactions, such as density-dependent
parasitism, are not expected. Comparisons between parasitism patterns in Texas and Mexico may suggest overall higher levels of parasitism in Mexico and lower and more erratic parasitism in Texas due to lower population levels of *P. citrella* or lower availability of alternate hosts.

In general, *P. citrella* and its parasitoids increased in Mexico from 1997 to 1999 and decreased in Texas from 1997 to 1998. The decline becomes more apparent when compared with surveys taken in 1995 (Legaspi et al., 1999). Many factors probably contributed to these differences, and one likely important determinant is climate. Mean monthly temperatures were higher in (Harlingen) Texas than in (Montemorelos) Mexico (Fig. 4) (paired t = 2.74; df = 11; P < 0.05). Mean monthly rainfall was not statistically different between

---

**FIG. 1.** Population dynamics of *P. citrella* and its natural enemies in Mexico (1997 and 1999). (A) Numbers of citrus leafminer (CLM) (sum of living and dead larvae, pupae, empty pupal cases divided by numbers of citrus leaves sampled) in 1997 by sampling date; (B) numbers of CLM/leaf in 1999; (C) monthly percentage parasitism of CLM in 1997; (D) Monthly percentage parasitism of CLM in 1999; (E) monthly numbers of parasites per leaf in 1997; (F) monthly numbers of parasites per leaf in 1999; (G) monthly numbers of predators per leaf in 1997; (H) monthly numbers of predators per leaf in 1999. Bar graphs below indicate corresponding months and numbers of leaves sampled.
However, for the months (May to November) during which *P. citrella* field populations increase, rainfall was significantly higher in Mexico (paired \( t = 3.45; \text{df} = 6; P < 0.05 \)). Although not conclusive, differences in *P. citrella* populations and, consequently, those of its parasitoid complexes may be at least partially attributed to a hotter, drier climate in Texas than in Mexico.

Comparisons of the native parasitoid complexes attacking *P. citrella* indicate interesting differences in the dominant parasitoid. About 80% of the native parasitoid complex in Florida is composed of *Pnigalio minio* (Walker) (Hymenoptera: Eulophidae) (Peña et al., 1996). Other species found were *Cirrospilus* sp. (7%), *Clostercerus* sp. (4%), *Z. multilineatum* (2%), and *Horismenus* sp. (5%) (all Eulophidae). Relatively high levels of parasitism, often 40–80%, indicated a potential need for conserving indigenous parasitoids in an integrated pest management system. In 1995 and 1996, the dominant native parasitoid in south Texas was *Z. multilineatum*, constituting 70–80% of all para-

**FIG. 2.** Population dynamics of *P. citrella* and its natural enemies in Texas (1997 and 1998). (A) Monthly total of numbers of citrus leafminer (CLM) (sum of living and dead larvae, pupae, empty pupal cases divided by numbers of citrus leaves sampled) in 1997; (B) numbers of CLM/leaf in 1998; (C) monthly percentage parasitism of CLM in 1997; (D) monthly percentage parasitism of CLM in 1998; (E) monthly numbers of parasites per leaf in 1997; (F) monthly numbers of parasites per leaf in 1998. Dashed lines indicate samples not taken in September 1997. Bar graphs below indicate corresponding months and numbers of leaves sampled.
sitoids recorded (Legaspi et al., 1999). Minor parasitoids included species of Pnigalio, Horismenus, and Closterocerus. In the state of Veracruz in Mexico, P. citrella is parasitized mostly by the eulophids Galeopsomyia sp. and Cirropilus spp. Other parasitoids recorded were Horismenus sp. and Elasmus tischeriae Howard (Hymenoptera: Elasmidae) (Bautista-Martinez et al., 1998). Total parasitism from November to March was high at about 70%. Surveys in the state of Colima, Mexico, also recorded parasitism of P. citrella by Cirropilus spp., Closterocerus spp., Horismenus sp., Elasmus, sp., Z multilineatum, and an unidentified encyrtid (Perales-Gutierrez et al., 1996) (relative abundances not indicated). Zagrommosoma multilineatum is the most important parasitoid in Nuevo Leon. While also true for south Texas, the importance of Z. multilineatum has declined together with populations of the host P. citrella. Although P. citrella is not currently a serious citrus pest in south Texas, migration from Mexico remains a risk. Furthermore, other citrus-growing areas of the United States are still vulnerable to P. citrella.

FIG. 3. (A) Regression of numbers of P. citrella hosts per leaf and percentage parasitism in Mexico. Y = 9.07 + 30.85x (SE constant = 2.7; SE slope = 8.5; F = 11.4; df = 1, 23; P < 0.01; R² = 0.33). (B) Regression of numbers of P. citrella hosts per leaf and percentage parasitism in Texas (F = 1.03; df = 1, 36; P = 0.32; R² < 0.01).

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We are grateful to T. X. Liu (Texas Agricultural Experiment Station, Weslaco), L. Bezark (California Department of Food and Agriculture, Sacramento), and two anonymous reviewers for helpful comments on the manuscript. Parasitoid identifications were performed by J. Woolley (Department of Entomology, Texas A&M University, College Station) and M. Reyes (Instituto Nacional de Investigaciones Forestales y Agropecuarias, Rio Bravo, Mexico). Technical assistance was provided by R. R. Saldana (Texas Agricultural Experiment Station, Weslaco), B. Cutrer (Texas A&M–Kingsville Citrus Center, Weslaco), and R. Serna and M. Molina (both from Universidad Autonoma de Nuevo Leon, San Nicolas de los Garza, Nuevo Leon, Mexico). Partial funding for this project was provided by Hatch Project 8426, the Texas–Mexico Initiative Challenge Grant, and the Programa de Apoyo a la Investigacion Cientifica y Tecnologica. This article reports the results of research only. Mention of a commercial or proprietary product does not constitute an endorsement or recommendation for its use by the Texas A&M University System or the U.S. Department of Agriculture. This article was approved for publication by the Director, Texas Agricultural Experiment Station.

REFERENCES


toid of the citrus leafminer, Phyllocnistis citrella (Lepidoptera: Gracillariidae). Fla. Entomol. 80, 461–470.